

ceived in Greek originally, can hardly be substantiated by any facts. The only thing really Greek in this text seems to be the (distorted) name of king Menandros.

Freiburg

O.v.Hinüber

REMARKS ON A LIST OF BOOKS SENT TO CEYLON FROM SIAM
IN THE 18TH CENTURY

The letter sent to the royal court at Kandy (Sirivaḍḍhanapura) on behalf of the king of Siam, and published in the present issue, includes some information of considerable interest for the study of the history of Pāli texts. For a shipment, which comprised no less than 97 books (sattanavuttipakaraṇāni) containing texts no longer extant on the island, and therefore asked for in a second document accompanying this letter (samaṇasandesa, § 2 at the end), is said to have been dispatched together with the letter. That the Siamese side readily complied to the request from Ceylon can be gathered from § 15 of the letter: "In the auspicious letter (subhakkhara) sent by you (i.e. the aggamahāsenāpati of Kandy: § 1 at the end) it is said that books on dhamma, vinaya, etc. are not available in Ceylon. Having heard this, and that no other books on dhamma and vinaya than those mentioned in the letter on religious matters (samaṇalekha, cf. § 13 and elsewhere) have been asked for to reestablish these texts there (i.e. in Ceylon), I reported this to the best of lawful and pious kings with all due respect and having risen my folded hands over my head. <§ 16> The best of lawful and pious kings joyfully gave 97 texts, namely ... to establish them in Ceylon."

For easy reference the list is repeated here with a number given to each individual text:

1. Sumaṅgalavilāsinīcatuṭṭhakathāsuttapiṭaka²
2. Paṭhamasamantapāsādikādīpaṇcavinayaṭṭhakathāpiṭaka
3. Moggallānapakaraṇa
4. Aṭṭhakathāvinayaṣaṭṭhikā
5. Vimativinodanī
6. Rūpasiddhi
7. Bālapabodhisattikā
8. Bālāvatārasaṭṭhikā
9. Saddasārasaṭṭhikā
10. Saddabindupakaraṇa
11. Kaccāyanatṭhapakaraṇa
12. Sampīḍamahanīdāna
13. Vimānavatthupakaraṇa
14. Petavatthupakaraṇa
15. Cakkavālādīpanīpakaraṇa
16. Sotabbamālinīpakaraṇa
17. Soḷasakīmahanīdāna
18. Lokadīpaka
19. Lokavināsa
20. Jambūpatīsutta
21. Theragāthāpakaraṇa
22. Therīgāthāpakaraṇa
23. Anuṭṭikāsaṅgaha

24. Mahāvamsapakaraṇa
25. Maṅgaladīpanīpakaraṇa
26. Majjhimanikāya
27. Paṇḍasūdanīatthakathāmajjhimanikāya
28. Aṅguttaranikāya
29. Manorathapūraṇī
30. Sammohavinodanīatthakathāvivhaṇḍa
31. Vajirabuddha(!)ṭṭikā
32. Nettipakarāṇa
33. Cullavagga
34. Mahāvagga
35. Parivāra
36. Atthakathāmātikāpakaraṇa
37. Vinayavinicchaya
38. Ṭikāsaṅgaha
39. Anuṭṭikāsaṅgaha
40. Vibhaṇḍapakaraṇa
41. Dhutaṅga
42. Kaṅkhāvitaraṇī
43. Paṇḍapakarāṇa-atthakathāparamatthadīpanī
44. Sumaṅgalavilāsinīatthakathādighanikāya
45. Silakhandhavagga
46. Mahāvagga
47. Pāṭikaṭikā (!): mistake for Pāṭikavagga(?)
48. Paramatthavinicchaya
49. Saccasaṅkhepa
50. Paramatthadīpanīsaṅkhepa
51. Ṭikāsaccasaṅkhepa
52. Paramatthamañjūsāṭikāvisuddhimagga
53. Ṭikāparamatthavinicchaya
54. Paramatthadīpanī
55. Ṭikākhuddakasikkhā
56. Atthakathātheragāthā
57. Sāratthajālīnī
58. Ṭikāpetavatthu
59. Ṭikāsuttanipāṭa
60. Ṭikācariyāpīṭaka
61. Ṭikānettipakarāṇa
62. Ṭikāatthakathāpaṭisambhidāmagga
63. Ṭikāitivuttaka
64. Atthakathāudāna
65. Atthakathācūlaniddesa
66. Pālibuddhavamsa
67. Ṭikābuddhavamsa
68. Pālianāgatavamsa
69. Atthakathāanāgatavamsa
70. Ṭikāanāgatavamsa
71. Ṭikāmilindapañha
72. Ṭikāmadhurasavāhinī
73. Ṭikāvinayavinicchaya
74. Yamakapakaraṇa
75. Buddhasiṅghanidāna

Not all texts named in this list can be identified easily either because the title itself cannot be traced elsewhere, and consequently

no relation to any known text can be established with confidence, as e.g. in the case of *Dhutaṅga*, no. 41, or because the title is ambiguous referring to a group rather than to any individual text such as *Ṭikāsaṅgaha*.

Further, the method of calculating the number of manuscripts dispatched to Ceylon is anything but lucid. Although the total is stated explicitly to be 97, it is not easy to see, how this figure has been reached at. A simple count of titles amounts to 75 only, to which 10 may be added, as two copies each (*dvipakarāṇa*) have been sent of the items no. 13, 14, 23, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 42, 74, and further four items, nos. 4, 7, 8, 9 have been qualified as *saṭṭikā*, what amounts to a total of 89 only. Consequently 8 titles seem to be missing, which, however, may be suspected as hidden in the very beginning of the list: "2. the first (part) of the *Samantapāsādikā* etc., the commentary on the five(fold) *Vinayapīṭaka*". A fivefold division of Sp is found elsewhere in manuscripts³ also: *Pārājikakaṇḍa*, *Pācīyādikaṇḍa*, *Mahāvagga*, *Cullavagga*, *Parivāra*.

While this title can be explained easily, the exact meaning of the first one remains doubtful. However, a similar title is found in both lists of texts, found in the prologue and epilogue respectively to the *Traibhūmikathā* of King Ruang completed probably in AD 1345. Here, an *atthakathācaturāgama* is mentioned, which should mean a commentary on the four *nikāyas*, as these are called *āgamas* in the introductory verses e.g. to Sv or Ps. However, exactly as in our list, where Sv, no. 44 and Mp, no. 27 are found again named separately, all four commentaries on the *nikāyas* are mentioned by their individual names in the *Traibhūmikathā*. In our list Sv occurs even twice as no. 1 and no. 44. And as a title such as "*Sumaṅgalavilāsinī* <and(?)> the four commentaries on the *Suttapīṭaka*" hardly makes much sense, some mistake may be suspected here. Further, the four commentaries together with the five parts of Sp amount to 9 items, bringing the total up to 99 instead to 97 items. Even if nos. 28 and 29 are united and supposed to name only Mp, there is still one title too much. Therefore it does not seem to be possible at present to solve this puzzle.

As no order can be recognized in the sequence of titles evidently listed at random, it may not be totally useless to rearrange the list subjectwise following the principles and using as far as this seems suitable numbering and abbreviations of H. Smith: *Epilegomena* to Volume I (of the *Critical Pāli Dictionary*). Copenhagen 1948.

I. *Vinaya* texts:

Kkh, no. 42: 1.1,1: This text, too, seems to be named twice in the list: *Mātikā-atthakathā*, no. 36, cf. K.R. Norman: *Pāli Literature. A History of Indian Literature VII* 2. Wiesbaden 1983, p. 126 on the title. A single phūk of a rather old manuscript bearing this title and copied in CS 933, year of the goat, corresponding to AD 1571, is kept in Vat Phra Singh in Chiang Mai today. However, the content of this manuscript has not been checked yet.

Mahāvagga, no. 34

Cullavagga, no. 33: Vin 1.2

Parivāra, no. 35

Sp, no. 2 and no. 4 (*saṭṭikā*): 1.2,1

Vjb, no. 31: 1.2,11

Sp-ṭ, no. 4: 1.2,12

- Vmv, no. 5: 1.2,13
 Khuddas-ṭ, no. 55: 1.3.1,1 or 2: -pṭ or -nṭ?
 Vin-vn, no. 37: 1.3.3
 Vin-vn-ṭ, no. 73: 1.3.3,1 or 2: -pṭ or -nṭ?

II. Sutta texts:

- Silakhandha, no. 45
 Mahāvagga, no. 46: DN 2.1
 Pāṭikaṭikā(!?), no. 47
 Sv, no. 1 and 44: 2.1,1
 MN, no. 26: 2.2
 Ps, no. 27: 2.2,1
 AN, no. 28: 2.4
 Mp, no. 29: 2.4,1

It may be worth while to note that neither SN nor Spk have been asked for by the Sinhalese monks. Consequently these texts, which have not been sent to Ceylon, seem to have survived in the island. And indeed a continuous Sinhala tradition of SN and Spk is mirrored by the manuscript tradition, which shows very clearly marked differences between those manuscripts copied in Ceylon and others stemming from South East Asia: O.v.Hinüber: Pāli Manuscripts of Canonical Texts from North Thailand. Journal of the Siam Society 71. 1983. 75-88, and: Die Sprachgeschichte des Pāli im Spiegel der süd-ostasiatischen Handschriftenüberlieferung. Akademie der Wissenschaften und der Literatur, Mainz. Abhandlungen der geistes- und sozialwissenschaftlichen Klasse. Jahrgang 1988. Wiesbaden 1988.

- Ud-a, no. 84: 2.5.3,1
 It-ṭ, no. 63: 2.5.4,12
 Sn-ṭ, no. 59: 2.5.5,12
 Vv, no. 13: 2.5.6
 Pv, no. 14: 2.5.7
 Pv-ṭ, no. 58: 2.5.7,12
 Th, no. 21: 2.5.8
 Th-a, no. 56: 2.5.8,1
 Thī, no. 22: 2.5.9
 Nidd-a II, no. 65: 2.5.11²,1
 Paṭis-a, no. 62: 2.5.12,1
 Paṭis-ṭ, no. 62: 2.5.12,13(?): The titles as given in the list might mean only the ṭikā, the identity of which is not clear, cf. Epilegomena.
 Bv, no. 66: 2.5.14
 Bv-ṭ, no. 67: 2.5.14,12
 Cp-ṭ, no. 60: 2.5.15,12

The ṭikās mentioned here, seem to be known otherwise from the Piṭakat-samuṃh only, where they are listed between nos. 217 and 228. No manuscript has been traced so far, not even in the National Library, Bangkok: R.Nagasaki, Buddhist Studies (Bukkyo Kenkyu). Hamamatsu. 5. 1976. 79-57, esp. p. 75.

III. Abhidhamma texts:

a. Canonical texts:

- Vibh, no. 40: 3.2
 Vibh-a, no. 30: 3.2,1
 Pañcapakaraṇa-a, no. 43: 3.3,1 - 3.7,1
 Yam, no. 74: 3.6

b. Non-canonical texts:

- Pm-vn, no. 48: 3.8.2: This text has been edited twice since the Epilegomena appeared: 1. A.P.Buddhadatta, JPTS 10.1985. 155-226; 2. Rangoon 1962 together with Abhidh-av, Nāmar-p, Sacc.
 Pm-vn-ṭ, no. 53: 3.8.2,1 or 2: -pṭ or -nṭ?
 Sacc, no. 49: 3.8.6
 Sacc-ṭ, no. 51: 3.8.6,1 or 2: -pṭ or -nṭ?

IV. Paracanonical texts:

- Mil-ṭ, no. 71: 2.6.1: cf. JPTS 11. 1987. 111-119 with an additional note in the present issue.
 Nett, no. 32: 2.7.2
 Nett-ṭ, no. 61: 2.7.2,11 or 12: -pṭ or -nṭ?
 Vism-mhṭ, no. 42: 2.8.1,1

V. Historical and future texts:

- Mhv, no. 24: 4.1.2: This is almost certainly a copy of the so called "Cambodian" Mhv, because all manuscripts known are either in or copied from originals in Khmer script: Extended Mahāvamsa, ed. by G.P.Malalasekera. Aluvihāra Series Volume VIII. Colombo 1937, and: O.v.Hinüber: The Tittira-Jātaka and the Extended Mahāvamsa. Journal of the Siam Society 70. 1982. 71-75.
 Anāg, no. 68: 4.4.1
 Anāg-a, no. 69: 4.4.1,1
 Anāg-ṭ, no. 70: 4.4.1,2: Again it is impossible to tell, exactly which text is meant here: On the different versions of this future text: Norman, as above on 1.1,1, p. 160-162. Still another version of this text seems to be contained in a manuscript copied most probably in the 16th century and preserved at Vat Phra Singh, Chiang Mai, now. Only phūk 2: ga, gha and phūk 3: ña, ca are extant. This manuscript has been copied by Nānbhadra and brought to Chiang Mai from Chiang Saen. The title Mahānāgatavaṃsa occurs on the cover leaf of phūk 3.

VI. Grammatical texts:

- Kacc, no. 11: 5.1: As this text is called Kaccāyanatṭhapakaraṇa, it seems to comprehend the unādikappa: Epilegomena, p. 96*: 5.1.
 Rūp, no. 6: 5.1,4
 Bālāv, no. 8: 5.1,5
 Bālāv-ṭ, no. 8: 5.1,51
 Mogg, no. 3: 5.3
 Saddabindu, no. 10: 5.4.5: F.Lottemoser: Minor Pāli Grammar Texts: The Saddabindu and Its "New" Subcommentary. JPTS 11. 1987. 79-108. - A manuscript of this text is found in the Vat Phra Singh, Chiang Mai, which also con-

tains **Saddavutti** and **Sāratthajālīnī**.

Saddasāratthajālīnī, no. 57: 5.4.6: In spite of the fact that this text is usually known as **Sadda-Sāratthajālīnī**, the proposed identification seems to be very likely. Besides the manuscript mentioned already under 5.4.5, there is a second **Saddasāratthajālīnī** kept in the same monastery dated CS 888, year of the dog, corresponding to AD 1526. It comprises a single **phūk** containing folios **ka-kaḥ, kha-khaḥ, gha, ghā**.

Bālapabodhi, no. 7: 5.4.19: The usual title is **Bālapabodhinī**.

Bālapabodhi-ṭ, no. 7: 5.4.19,1

Saddasāra, no. 9: Title and position in the list might point to a grammatical text and its **ṭikā**, though both are untraceable till now in the **Epilegomena** or elsewhere.

VII. Miscellaneous titles:

Titles such as **ṭikāsaṅgaha**, no. 38, or **Anuṭikāsaṅgaha**, no. 23 and 39 allow for a wide range of possible identifications. However, as nos. 38 and 39 are preceded by **vinaya** texts, they may well belong to that category, too. On similar reasons **Paramatthadīpanī**, no. 54, may be classified as **abhidhamma** rather than as the well known commentary on the **Khuddakanikāya**, particularly, as a **Paramatthadīpanisaṅkhepa**. no. 50, occurs as well. Neither text is listed in the **Epilegomena**, as **Paramatthadīpanī**, 3.8.1,5 has been written during the last century.

The **Madhurasavāhinī**, no. 72, is mentioned in the **Gandhavaṃsa**, and a text of this title has been microfilmed by H. Mundius in Lamphun in 1972/74 (roll 12/174)⁶, cf. also Norman, as above on 1.1.1, p. 155 on the possible relation of this text to Ras; the **Piṭakat-samuḥ** lists a **Madhurara(!)savāhinīnissaya**. However, no **ṭikā** is ever mentioned.

The contents of the **Dhutaṅga**, no. 41, cannot be ascertained, but cf. Norman, as above on 1.1.1, p. 114 on **Vimuttimaggā** and **Dhutaṅga-nirdeśa**(??); cf. also **Dhutaṅgavatthu** in Finot's list (below VIII), p. 183, no. 162.

VIII. South East Asian Pāli texts:

A summary of the still rather unsatisfactory knowledge about Pāli literature in South East Asia with the exception of Burma has been given by H. Saddhatissa in a series of three articles: Pāli Literature of Thailand, in: **Buddhist Studies in Honour of I.B. Horner**. Dordrecht 1974, 211-225 also covering Laos; Pāli Studies in Cambodia, in: **Buddhist Studies in Honour of Walpola Rahula**. London 1980, 242-250; Pāli Literature in Cambodia. JPTS 9. 1981. 178-197. In spite of these useful contributions, older articles may be still consulted with profit: L. Finot: *Recherches sur la littérature laotienne*. BEFEO 17. 1917. 1-221 supplemented by: P.-B. Lafont: *Inventaire des manuscrits des pagodes de Laos*. BEFEO 52. 1964/65. 429-545, further: G. Coedès: *Note sur les ouvrages palis composés en pays Thai*. BEFEO 15. 1915. 39-46, cf. also the recent book by Supaphan na Bangchang: *Vivāḍhanākār ṇān kheyān bhāṣā pāli nai prahdeś daiy: cārūk, tām nān, baṇṣavātār, sāsan, prahkās* <Development of Writing in Pāli in Thailand: Inscriptions, Historical Writing, Chronicals, Royal Messages, Proclamations> Bangkok 2529 <1986>.

In the **Epilegomena**, only comparatively few texts have been listed: **Maṅgaladīpanī**, no. 25: 2.9.10: The usual title is **Maṅgalatthadīpanī**, Finot, p. 71 foll.; **Saddhatissa** (1974), p. 217. The

text has been edited in two volumes in Bangkok 2517 (vol. I), 2515 (vol. II) <1974, 1972>.

Lokadīpaka, no. 18: 2.9.17: Most probably identical with **Lokappadīpaka-sāra**, cf. Lafont, no. 408. The text has been edited in Bangkok 2529 <1986>; on this and further unpublished editions as well as old manuscripts: O.v. Hinüber: *The Pāli Manuscripts Kept at the Siam Society*, Bangkok. *Journal of the Siam Society* 75.1986. 9-74, no. 16, p. 27.

The **Lokavināsa**, no. 19, is extant in Thailand according to an oral communication by H. Mundius.

Cakkavāḍadīpanī, no. 15: **Saddhatissa** (1974), p. 217: The text has been composed in CS 882 corresponding to AD 1520 as stated in the colophon. Therefore the oldest known manuscript dated CS 900 corresponding to AD 1538 is exceptionally near to the original. The four **phūk**, which are surviving, have been microfilmed: *Catalogue of palm-leaf texts on microfilm at the Social Research Institute, Chiang Mai University*. 1978-1986. Chiang Mai 1986, p. 41, no. 78.0009. 01J117-120. The text has been edited in Bangkok 2523 <1980> with a Thai translation.

Sotabbamālinī, no. 16: Listed by Finot, no. 895, p. 208; cf. **Saddhatissa** (1974), p. 219. The text has been edited in Ceylon as early as 1911, what had escaped the attention of the authors of the **Epilegomena**, where no edition is listed.

Soḷasakimāhānidāna, no. 17: An alternative title of this text is **Sotatt(h)akimāhānidāna**, cf. **Epilegomena**, p. 87*b. The text, which contains the story of the past Buddhas, has been edited with an extremely confused introduction by W. Sailer, Bangkok 2526 <1983> as a cremation book for **Somdec Braḥmācārya**, Vat Suthat, Bangkok. Similar in content is the **Jinamahānidāna**, edited in Bangkok 2530 <1987> in two volumes. Both texts are accompanied by a Thai translation.

Sampiṇḍamahānidāna, no. 13: Alternative titles are **Sampiṇḍitamahānidāna** and **Mahāsampiṇḍitanidāna**: **Saddhatissa** (1981), p. 180 foll. An edition, which has been announced here and by I.B. Horner <trsl.>: *The Minor Anthologies of the Pāli Canon. Part III: Chronicles of the Buddhas (Bv) and Basket of Conduct (Cp)*. London 1975, p. XI does not seem to have been appeared. - It remains a matter of conjecture, whether this text is mentioned under the title **Mahānidāna** in both lists of the **Traibhūmikathā**, cf. note 4.

Jambupatisutta, no. 20: The contents of this text is given by Finot, p. 66-69, cf. Finot's list no. 209, p. 185 and **Saddhatissa** (1974), p. 222.

Buddhasiṅgānidāna, no. 75: This text composed by Bodhiraṇsi at the beginning of the 15th century, tells the legend of a famous Thai Buddha image: Finot's list no. 621, 622, p. 199; **Saddhatissa** (1974), p. 213; K.L. Hazra: *The Buddhist Annals and Chronicles of South-East Asia*. Delhi 1986, p. 55-63 mainly based upon: D.K.

Wyatt: Chronicle Traditions in Thai Historiography, in: South East Asian History and Historiography. Essays Presented to D.G.E.Hall. Ithaca 1976, 107-122, esp. p. 117, where editions and the English translation by C.Notton, Bangkok 1933, are listed.

The reasons for sending these last two text are given in paragraph no. 39 and 40 of the letter. Further, the following texts are mentioned in this letter: Ittipisobhagavāḍibuddhamanta, which refers to the Dhajaggasutta, SN I 219,31-220,13. The quotation from the Maṅgalasuttavaṇṇanā, § 21: sace ...nāgghati corresponds to Maṅgalatthadīpanī, Bangkok 1972, II 37,19-38,2 except for the verse. None of the quotations from the Dhammānisaṅsa in paragraph 22, Manussavinaya, § 34 nor Pācīyādivaṇṇanā, § 35 could be traced so far. In spite of the fact that the last quotation clearly refers to Vin IV 202 foll., it is not traceable at the respective passages in Sp, Vaj, Sp-ṭ, Vmv.

Finally, it would be interesting to know, what might have happened to the books and the letter after they had left Siam. In this respect at least some information can be gathered from the Cūlavamsa. In the chapters 99 and 100 the events during the reign of Kittisiri-rāja (1747-1781) are related, and the verses Mhv 100, 160.163 foll. refer to our letter. Thus there is no room for doubt that both, letter and books arrived safely at Kandy. Further it may be concluded from how books sent earlier from Siam (Mhv 100,72.80.86) have been handled that those sent in 1756, too, have been given to the Pupphā-rāma (Malvattavihāra). This is corroborated by the fact, that the letter of 1756 is still kept at that monastery as stated in the introduction to the edition.

By lucky coincidence the books seem to have left at least one very clear trace in the manuscript tradition. For it is stated in the colophon to the Pāli manuscript PA(Sinh.) 21 kept at the Royal Library in Copenhagen that this Th-a was copied in 1768 from a Siamese original, which may well be no. 56 of the list given in the letter of the year 1756. Of course more copies must have been made from these books, but no colophon has preserved this information, which, consequently, is lost to us.

Freiburg

O.v.Hinüber

Notes

- 1 The Pāli text is not clear: Read °pakaraṇe na in two words and take pakaraṇa as masc. (??). Confusion of gender does occur in SE Asian Pāli, though usually the nt. is preferred: G.Terral: Samudagghosajātaka. Conte Pāli tiré du Paññāsajātaka. BEFEO 36. 1936. 249-351, esp. p. 319 foll.
- 2 The titles are given here in the usual Thai way, i.e. atthakathā-vinaya for vinayattakathā.
- 3 C.E.Godakumbura: A Catalogue of Cambodian and Burmese Pāli Manuscripts. Copenhagen 1983, p. 7: catutthasamantapāsādikā, PA(Camb.) 5, note 1.
- 4 Three Worlds According to King Ruang. A Thai Buddhist Cosmology.

Trsl. by F.E. and M.B.Reynolds. Berkeley 1982, p. 46, 349 foll.; the latest edition has been prepared by Pitoon Malivan (Bidura Malivalya): Traibhūmikathā hrūp traibhūmi brah rvañ. Bangkok 2526 <1983>(3rd printing). The lists p. 2, 156 extracted by the editor on p. 187 foll. are unfortunately marred by misprints; cf. also H. Saddhatissa: The Dawn of Pāli Literature in Thailand, in: Malalasekera Commemoration Volume. Colombo 1976, p. 315-324, where the first list from the Traibhūmikathā can be found on p. 318; it is not said, from which edition this list is derived, which contains some obvious mistakes. - On the date of the text: Reynolds, p. 45.

- 5 See CPD s.v. āgama 7; the term caturāgama is not found elsewhere.
- 6 These microfilms are available in the National Library and at the Cūlalonkorn University, both Bangkok, and at the Indological Institutes at Kiel and Göttingen.
- 7 On ānisaṃsa texts in general: Saddhatissa (1981), p. 185 and G. Coedès: Catalogue des manuscrits en Pāli, Laotien et Siamois provenant de la Thaïlande. Copenhagen 1966, p. 34a, 49a, 71a.
- 8 C.E.Godakumbura: Catalogue of Ceylonese Manuscripts. Copenhagen 1980, p. 31-33, where a second manuscript copied from a Siamese original is mentioned.